

---

MEETING	SCRUTINY MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE
DATE	4 APRIL 2011
PRESENT	COUNCILLORS ALEXANDER (VICE-CHAIR), ORRELL, FIRTH, WAUDBY, SIMPSON-LAING, TAYLOR, GUNNELL AND HEALEY (SUBSTITUTE FOR COUNCILLOR GALVIN)
APOLOGIES	COUNCILLOR GALVIN
IN ATTENDANCE	COUNCILLOR BOYCE (ITEMS 1-4 ONLY) COUNCILLOR LOOKER (ITEMS 1-4 ONLY) COUNCILLOR D'AGORNE COUNCILLOR FUNNELL

---

## 22. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

Members were invited to declare any personal or prejudicial interests they might have in the business on the agenda. The following interests were declared:

- Councillor Simpson-Laing declared a personal interest in agenda item 4 (Report from Chair of Learning and Culture Overview & Scrutiny Committee) as Treasurer of the Friends of Back Park.
- Councillor Taylor declared a personal interest in agenda item 5 (Edible York Ad Hoc Scrutiny Committee) as a member of the Friends of St Nicholas Fields.

## 23. MINUTES

RESOLVED: That the minutes of the SMC meeting held on 28 February 2011 and the minutes of the Edible York Ad Hoc Scrutiny Committee meeting held on 22 March 2011 be confirmed and signed as a correct record.

## 24. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

It was reported that there were no registrations to speak under the council's Public Participation Scheme.

## 25. REPORTS FROM CHAIRS OF SCRUTINY COMMITTEES

In accordance with the council's Constitution, Chairs of the Scrutiny Committees were required to report to SMC on a bi-annual basis. The Chairs of the following scrutiny committees were in attendance to provide an overview of their committee's work and to highlight the key achievements in 2010/11.

### (i) Health Overview & Scrutiny Committee

Councillor Boyce informed Members that the Health Overview & Scrutiny Committee had been extremely active. As well as holding eight full committee meetings, there had been numerous task group meetings. Members of the community often participated at meetings under the council's Participation Scheme, and health professionals and representatives from the voluntary sector were regular attendees. The committee worked closely with key partners including the hospital, PCT, the Ambulance Service and York LINKs.

Details were given of some of the issues that had been considered by the committee including the Department of Health "Transforming Community Services" programme. The Executive, via SMC, had referred an item on the Joint Strategic Needs Assessment to the committee and a presentation had been received on this issue. The committee gave regular consideration to monitoring and performance reports, including reports from partner organisations.

The committee had carried out the following reviews:

- Childhood Obesity – the recommendations of which had been generally supported by the Executive.
- Carers – this report was due to be considered by the Executive later in the month.

Consideration had also been given to carrying out a review on issues surrounding maternity services to new mothers. After having received a presentation on this

issue, the committee had been satisfied with the responses put forward and had decided not to proceed with a review.

The committee was represented on a regional joint health committee that had been established to look at issues in respect of the national review of children's cardiac surgery services.

The Executive Member for Health and Adult Social Services and the Chair of SMC had attended meetings of the committee.

(ii) Learning and Culture Overview & Scrutiny Committee

Councillor Looker explained how the remit of the Learning and Culture Overview & Scrutiny Committee had been extended from that of the former Education Scrutiny Committee and now included issues in respect of leisure and heritage.

Details were given of the scrutiny review that the committee had carried out on casual play opportunities and the ways in which the committee had been involved in pre-decision/early scrutiny. It had been particularly useful for the committee to have been able to contribute to the drawing-up of the council's new play policy and play provision.

The committee had also proposed to carry out a review on youth service provision but, in view of the current financial situation, it had been decided that it would be more appropriate for the committee to receive regular updates from senior officers and to work with them as the remodelling of youth service provision continued.

As part of their monitoring role, the committee had given particular attention to the budget for Looked After Children, as expenditure on this provision was often difficult to predict. The committee also received regular reports from York Theatre Royal and York Museums Trust.

The Executive Member for Children and Young People's Services had attended committee meetings and

responded to questions put forward by committee members. The committee had also received briefings from officers on issues including the government's new education policies and the possible implications for York.

(iii) Community Safety Overview & Scrutiny Committee

Owing to the late start of the meeting, Councillor Fraser was unable to be present to deliver a report on the work of the Community Safety Overview & Scrutiny Committee and the report was therefore deferred.

Councillors Boyce and Looker were thanked for their informative reports.

- RESOLVED:
- (i) That the reports from the Chairs of the Health Overview & Scrutiny Committee and the Learning and Culture Overview & Scrutiny Committee be noted.
  - (ii) That thanks be recorded to Members serving on scrutiny committees for the work that they had carried out.

REASON: To ensure that SMC is updated on the work of scrutiny committees in accordance with the council's Constitution.

**26. EDIBLE YORK AD HOC SCRUTINY COMMITTEE - FINAL REPORT**

Members received a report that presented the final report arising from the Edible York Ad Hoc Scrutiny Committee. Councillor D'Agorne, the Chair of the Ad Hoc Scrutiny Committee, went through the key issues and recommendations. He paid tribute to the work that had been carried out by the scrutiny officer to support the committee during the review.

Members expressed their support of the recommendations arising from the review and suggested that a proportion of the fifty thousand trees within the York New City Beautiful project should be fruit and nut trees.

- RESOLVED:
- (i) That the final report, including the Recommendations detailed at paragraphs 62 to 68, be approved and forwarded to the Executive for consideration with the inclusion of a statement that a proportion of the fifty thousand trees within the York New City Beautiful project should be fruit and nut trees.
  - (ii) That thanks be recorded to the Edible York Ad Hoc Scrutiny Committee for their work in carrying out the review.

REASON: To complete the scrutiny review.

**27. PROPOSED AMALGAMATION OF EFFECTIVE ORGANISATION AND SCRUTINY MANAGEMENT COMMITTEES.**

Members received a report that proposed changes to the Overview & Scrutiny structure. The proposed changes had arisen as a result of the recent consultation on the current overview and scrutiny function in York. Members were asked to consider amalgamating the terms of reference for the Effective Organisation Overview & Scrutiny Committee with those of the Scrutiny Management Committee, in order to create a more purposeful SMC dealing with corporate and management issues.

Concerns were expressed at the proposal to amalgamate the terms of reference of the two committees. Whilst it was acknowledged that when the Effective Organisation Overview & Scrutiny Committee was first established there had been some confusion around its role, Members stated that the committee had since moved forward and had carried out some worthwhile reviews. There were a number of forthcoming issues relating to organisational change with which the committee would also wish to be involved.

Members stated that they were also concerned as to whether the Scrutiny Management Committee would have the capacity to take on the work currently carried out by the Effective Organisation Overview & Scrutiny Committee, taking into

account its responsibilities for managing and over viewing scrutiny within the council and considering call-ins.

Officers gave details of other options for carrying out the scrutiny function, including possible alternatives to the current arrangements for dealing with call-ins. Members suggested that it would be useful for a report to be presented to the committee that provided more detail on these wider issues, prior to a decision being taken as to whether to recommend that the terms of reference for SMC and the Effective Organisation Overview & Scrutiny Committee be amalgamated.

RESOLVED: That a further report be received during the new Municipal Year providing more detail as to possible options in respect of the terms of reference of SMC and the Effective Organisation Overview & Scrutiny Committee<sup>1</sup>.

REASON: To ensure the scrutiny function remains robust and fit for purpose.

Action Required

1. Prepare report for future SMC meeting

DS

Chair

[The meeting started at 6.15 pm and finished at 7.30 pm].